# Formation of Highly Dispersed Ultrafine MnO<sub>2</sub> Nanoparticles on Nitrogen-doped Porous Carbon for Supercapacitor Applications

Xiaoxiao Du<sup>1</sup>, Qiong Chen<sup>2</sup>, Cuili Xiang<sup>1,\*</sup>, Yongjin Zou<sup>1</sup>, Fen Xu<sup>1</sup>, Jingjing Xie<sup>3</sup>, Lixian Sun<sup>1,\*</sup>

 <sup>1</sup> Guangxi Key Laboratory of Information Materials, Guilin University of Electronic Technology, Guilin 541004, P.R. China
<sup>2</sup> The Fifth Electronic Research Institute of the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, Guangzhou, 510610, China
<sup>3</sup> State Key Laboratory of Advanced Technology for Materials Synthesis and Processing, Wuhan University of Technology, Wuhan, 430070, China
\*E-mail: <u>xiangcuili@guet.edu.cn</u>; <u>sunlx@guet.edu.cn</u>

Received: 9 January 2019 / Accepted: 31 January 2019 / Published: 10 April 2019

Formation of transition metal oxide doped nanostructures with high surface area is highly desirable for electrochemical applications. Here, ultrafine MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles dispersed nitrogen-doped porous carbons (MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C) was synthesized using chitosan and Mn(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub> as precursor. The MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C demonstrates outstanding supercapacitive properties and great potential for real-world applications. The capacitance of the nanocomposite is as high as 340.1 F g<sup>-1</sup> (1 A g<sup>-1</sup>) in 1 M KOH solution. The MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C also shows high-rate capability, retaining a specific capacitance of 270.2 F g<sup>-1</sup> at 10 A g<sup>-1</sup>. The large specific surface area and highly-dispersed MnO<sub>2</sub> combined with its unique structural advantages, make it a very promising electrode material for energy storage devices.

Keywords: MnO<sub>2</sub>; Supercapacitor; N-doped; Highly dispersed; Nanocomposite

# **1. INTRODUCTION**

Supercapacitor is an attractive energy storage device, which possesses high power density, short charge-discharging time, light weight and long-cycle life [1, 2]. There are two types of supercapacitor according the charge storage mechanisms. One is electrical double layer capacitor (EDLC). The charges can be stored on the surface of the electrode materials electrostatically. Therefore, materials for EDLC must have high surface area, which can provide effective sites for the charge accumulation. Carbonaceous materials are widely used as the electrode materials for EDLC [3,

4]. The other type of supercapacitor is pseudocapacitor. The electrical energy is stored through the reversible Faradaic reactions. Transition metal oxides and conducting polymers are well-known materials for electrochemical active materials [5-9], which are widely used in pseudocapacitors. However, both types of supercapacitor have their advantages and disadvantages. For instance, EDLC has outstanding stability, high power density and long cycle life owing to the good stability and conductivity of carbon materials. However, EDLC has low capacitance, usually less than 300 F g<sup>-1</sup>. While the pseudocapacitors have extremely high capacitance (more than 1000 F g<sup>-1</sup>), however, the stability are poor because of the low conductivity and the volume change of the active materials. Therefore, combination of the EDLC and pseudocapacitors has become the favorite way to improve the electrochemical performance of the supercapacitors.

MnO<sub>2</sub>, a widely used energy material, has excellent electrochemical activity and stability [10-12]. The theoretical capacitance of MnO<sub>2</sub> electrode is as high as 1370 F g<sup>-1</sup>. Furthermore, MnO<sub>2</sub> based materials can work at neutral aqueous electrolyte, which reduced the corrosion of active materials [13]. Therefore, different nanostructures of MnO<sub>2</sub> including nanoparticles, nanowires, nanorods, nanourchins have been prepared. For instance, Bai et al. synthesized porous multidimensional MnO<sub>2</sub> via hydrothermal method, which demonstrated high supercapacitive property (311.52 F g<sup>-1</sup> at 0.3 A g<sup>-1</sup>) [14]. Feng et al. prepared free-standing MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoflowers. A high specific capacitance of 368.3 F g<sup>-1</sup> was obtained at 0.2 A g<sup>-1</sup> [15]. By simple template-assisted hydrothermal method, Wang et al. prepared bowl-like MnO<sub>2</sub> nanosheets. The resulting MnO<sub>2</sub> nanosheets exhibit a high specific (379 F g<sup>-1</sup> at 0.5 A g<sup>-1</sup>) [16]. Though the electrochemical performance of MnO<sub>2</sub> can be tuned by manipulating its structure, the capacitance of MnO<sub>2</sub> is still much lower than the theoretical value owing to its poor electrical conductivity and low structural stability. To address this problem, the MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles have to be anchored on the carbon-based materials [17-20]. However, dispersion of ultrafine MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles [21-23].

Herein, a composite of highly dispersed MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles anchored nitrogen-doped porous carbon was facilely prepared by carbonization of the mixture of chitosan and Mn(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub>. Compared with previous approaches, the proposed method not only greatly enhances contactable area of MnO<sub>2</sub> with carbon substrate, but also effectively improves the stability of active materials. It provides a stable, scalable, and cost-effective route to fabricate MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C nanocomposite, which is important for energy storage devices.

## 2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### 2.1. Synthesis of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C

Chitosan and  $Mn(NO_3)_2$  were employed as precursors. Briefly, 1 g of chitosan powder and 1 g of acetic acid was added to 100 mL of deionized water and stirred vigorously, followed by the addition of 0.01 g of  $Mn(NO_3)_2$  under stirring. Then the solvent was evaporated at 60 °C in a vacuum for 24 h. The solid was collected and carbonized at 800 °C for 3 h under Ar flow to obtain the final  $MnO_2/N$ -C. For comparison, the chitosan derived carbon was prepared under the identical condition and denoted as

Chit-C.

# 2.2. Characterization

The morphology of the resulting samples was examined by scanning electron microscopy (SEM, Quanta 200) and (high-resolution) transmission electron microscopy ((HR)TEM, Tecnai F20, FEI). The crystallographic properties of the samples were measured on an X-ray diffractometer (1820 Philips) using Cu Ka radiation between 5° and 80°. The chemical state of the elements in the samples was characterized by the X-ray photoelectron spectrometer (XPS, Thermo Fisher Scientific). N<sub>2</sub> adsorption/desorption measurements was determined by Brunauer–Emmett–Teller (BET) method using a Quantachrome Autosorb-iQ2 Automated gas sorption system at 77 K.

#### 2.3. Electrochemical tests

All electrochemical studies were conducted on a CHI660E electrochemical workstation (Shanghai Chenhua Co., China) in 1 M KOH aqueous solution. The working electrodes were prepared using MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C as active material according our previous work [24]. An Ag/AgCl electrode was used as the reference electrode, and a platinum foil acted as the counter electrode. The specific capacitance was calculated based on established equations in the literature [24].

#### **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### 3.1. Characteristics of composite samples

The crystal structures of the prepared  $MnO_2/N$ -C and Chit-C were investigated using XRD technique. As shown in Figure 1, the diffraction pattern of  $MnO_2/N$ -C consists of peaks located at 35.0° 40.6°, 58.8° can be indexed to (101), (200), (211) of  $MnO_2$  (PDF No. 04-0591). Sharp diffraction peaks of  $MnO_2$  indicate the phase purity of the synthesized nanoparticles is good [25]. The broad diffraction peak centered at 42.9° in the sample of Chit-C is indexed to (100) planes of amorphous carbon [26-29]. The XRD results indicate that manganese oxide is  $MnO_2$ .

The morphologies of the sample  $MnO_2/N-C$  and Chit-C were characterized by SEM. Figure 2a shows the SEM image of Chit-C. The Chit-C only shows smooth surface, while the images of  $MnO_2/N-C$  demonstrate porous structure (Figure 2b). From the magnified images of  $MnO_2/N-C$ , it can be observed that the carbon substrate was covered with t high density of  $MnO_2$  nanoparticles (Figure 2c,d).



Figure 1. XRD pattern of the as-synthesized MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C and Chit-C.



Figure 2. SEM images of Chit-C (a) and MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C (b,c,d).

The microstructure of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C was further studied by TEM. As shown in Figure 3a, the porous structure of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C was further confirmed. The ultrafine MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles with an average diameter of 8 nm are well distributed on the carbon substrate (Figure 3b,c). No obvious aggregation was observed. Furthermore, from the HRTEM image of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C, the carbon becomes graphitic due to the catalytic effect of Mn species (Figure 3d).



Figure 3. TEM images (a,b,c) and HRTEM (d) image of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C.

Figure 4 shows the EDX elemental maps of C, Mn, O, and N in the sample of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C. The map shapes of C, Mn and O are almost similar, suggesting the Mn and O are uniformly distributed on the surface of carbon matrix. N can also be found in the composite, which comes from the precursor chitosan.



Figure 4. EDX elemental maps of C, Mn, O, and N in MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C.

The X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS) is a useful tool to study the chemical states of the elements [30-33]. The XPS data of sample MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C are shown in Figure 5. The C, Mn, O and N elements are confirmed in MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C (Figure 5a). Two peaks located at 641.5 eV and 653.4 eV in Mn 2p spectrum (Figure 5b), are identical with those of reported value of MnO<sub>2</sub> [34]. The Mn oxidation state can be identified from the Mn 3s core-level spectrum [34]. As shown in Figure 5c, the pin-orbit splitting energy of Mn 3s is 6.2 eV, indicating the existence of Mn<sup>2+</sup>. The N 1s core-level spectrum of the MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C composite is shown in Figure 5d. It shows that nitrogen has three chemical states in the composite. The peak at 398.6 eV is indexed to the N–C bond, whereas the peaks at 399.6 and 404.8 eV peak can be assigned to N=C and N–O bonds, respectively [35].



Figure 5. (a) Full XP spectrum of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C and high-resolution spectra of the (b) Mn 2p, (c) Mn 3s, and (d) N 1s.

The specific surface area of the active materials is an important factor for the charge storage in supercapacitor. Figure 6a shows the isotherm of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C, displaying a typical IV type curve, which indicates the existence of plenty of mesopores [36-38]. The BET surface area of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C was calculated to be 104.7 m<sup>2</sup> g<sup>-1</sup>, which is much higher surface area than reported transition metal doped carbon nanocomposite [10,11]. The MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C shows a narrow pore-size distribution with an average pore size of 4.1 nm (Figure 6b), which further confirms the existence of mesopores in MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C. The mesopores play important role of channels for accelerating the rapid transport of ions within MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C, which potentially provide an excellent platform for the charge storage [39-42].



Figure 6. (a)  $N_2$  adsorption/desorption isotherms of the  $MnO_2/N-C$ , and (b) pore-size distribution curves for the  $MnO_2/N-C$ .

## 3.2 Electrochemical characterization of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C

The MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C nanocomposite demonstrated unique structure and excellent physicochemical properties, which suitable for preparation of electrode materials. Figure 7 shows the galvanostatic charge-discharge (GCD) curves of the Chit-C and MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C electrodes at a current density of 1 A g<sup>-1</sup>. It can be seen that MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C electrode shows typical feature of pseudocapacitor. The charges can be stored and released quickly at equivalent time, indicating a good reversibility. The discharging time of Chit-C was much shorter than that of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C, indicating a lower charge storage capability under same conditions.



**Figure 7**. GCD curves of the MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C and Chit-C electrodes recorded at 1 A  $g^{-1}$ .

The capacitances were 340.1 and 56.4 F/g for  $MnO_2/N-C$  and ZIF-C, respectively. The capacitance of  $MnO_2/N-C$  electrode is more than 5 times higher than that of Chit-C, which indicates that the doping of  $MnO_2$  dramatically improve the electrochemical performance of  $MnO_2/N-C$  nanocomposite. The possible reason is that  $MnO_2$  enable the formation of graphitic carbon and

increase the specific surface area due to the spacer effect, while the carbon substrate facilitates the electron transfer of  $MnO_2$  and improve the stability of the metal oxide, demonstrating synergistic effect between the  $MnO_2$  nanoparticles and the porous carbon substrate. Furthermore, the doping of N in the carbon backbone also contributes the pseudocapacitance [43-46]. The specific capacitance of  $MnO_2/N-C$  prepared in this work is also comparable with the reported  $MnO_2$ -based materials (Table 1), demonstrating outstanding electrochemical performance.

Sample	Current density (A g <sup>-1</sup> )	Specific capacitance (F $g^{-1}$ )	Reference
CNF-MnO <sub>2</sub> /PPy	1	315.8	[1]
$\alpha$ -MnO <sub>2</sub>	0.3	311.52	[14]
MnO <sub>2</sub> /SC	0.5	231	[47]
MnO <sub>2</sub> /rGO	0.1	234.8	[48]
Mn <sub>3</sub> O <sub>4</sub> /MnO <sub>2</sub>	0.5	739	[49]
MnO <sub>2</sub> /N-rGO	0.2	368.3	[15]
Fe-doped MnO <sub>2</sub>	1	627.3	[50]
MnO <sub>2</sub> /g-C <sub>3</sub> N <sub>4</sub> @PPy NC	2	274	[51]
MnO <sub>2</sub> /N-C	1	340.1	This work

Table 1. Comparison of specific capacitance of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C with previous MnO<sub>2</sub> based materials



Figure 8. GCD curves of the MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C at the different density of 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 and 10 A/g.

Figure 8 shows the MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C electrode GCD curve of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C at different current density. The capacitance of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C decreased from 340.1 and 270.2 F  $g^{-1}$  when current densities increased from 1 to 10 A  $g^{-1}$ , representing 83.3% retention of the initial capacitance, indicating good high-rate

capacitance retention.

The CVs of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C at various scan rates are shown in Figure 9. There is one couple of redox peaks located at  $\sim 0.2$  V in the CV curves, indicating a faradaic redox reaction behavior. When increasing the scan rates from 5 to 50 mV s<sup>-1</sup>, the peak current densities increased accordingly. The shape of the CV curves can be well retained, indicating good electrochemical performance and high-rate capability [52, 53].



Figure 9. CV curves of the MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C recorded at different scan rates.

The cycling stability of the  $MnO_2/N-C$  electrode was studied by charging-discharging cell for 3000 cycles at the current density of 1 A g<sup>-1</sup>. As shown in Figure 10, the capacitance of the  $MnO_2/N-C$  electrode tended to be stable after 500 cycles. After 3000 cycles, the capacitance can be retained 87.6% of its initial capacitance, demonstrating high electrochemical stability.



Figure 10. Cycling stability of the MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C supercapacitor recorded at 1 A  $g^{-1}$ .

## 4. CONCLUSIONS

In summary, ultrafine MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles dispersed nitrogen-doped porous carbons was successfully synthesized using one-step carbonization approach. The specific capacitance of the composites is as high as 340.1 F g<sup>-1</sup> (1 A g<sup>-1</sup>). A specific capacitance of 270.2 F g<sup>-1</sup> can be retained at a high current density of 10 A g<sup>-1</sup>. Furthermore, the MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C sample shows ~87.6% capacitance retention after 3000 charge-discharge cycles. The excellent electrochemical performance of MnO<sub>2</sub>/N-C can be attributed to the synergistic effect between the MnO<sub>2</sub> and the carbon substrate.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was supported by the Guangxi undergraduate innovation and entrepreneurship training program (201810595016) and GXNSF (2016GXNSFFA380012, AD17195073, 2017GXNSFDA198018).

#### References

- 1. M.A.A.M. Abdah, N.M.M.A. Edris, S. Kulandaivalu, N.A. Rahman, Y. Sulaiman, *Int. J. Hydrogen Energy*, 43 (2018) 17328-17337.
- 2. Z. Deng, Q. Yi, Y. Zhang, H. Nie, J. Electroanal. Chem., 803 (2017) 95-103.
- 3. B. Liao, W. Wang, P. Long, X. Deng, B. He, Q. Liu, S. Yi, Carbon, 91 (2015) 30-37.
- 4. B. Liao, P. Long, B. He, S. Yi, Q. Liu, R. Wang, *Carbon*, 73 (2014) 155-162.
- 5. S. Chen, S. Liu, A. Wen, J. Zhang, H. Nie, J. Chen, R. Zeng, Y. Long, Y. Jin, R. Mai, *Electrochim. Acta*, 271 (2018) 312-318.
- 6. K. Deng, J. Zhou, X. Li, *Electrochim. Acta*, 114 (2013) 341-346.
- X. Zhao, S. Zhang, J. Yan, L. Li, G. Wu, W. Shi, G. Yang, N. Guan, P. Cheng, *Inorg. Chem.*, 57 (2018) 5030-5037.
- 8. J. Xu, A.R. Wilson, A.R. Rathmell, J. Howe, M. Chi, B.J. Wiley, ACS Nano, 5 (2011) 6119-6127.
- 9. Y. Zhang, Q. Yi, Z. Deng, X. Zhou, H. Nie, Catal. Lett., 148 (2018) 1190-1201.
- 10. K. Deng, C. Li, X. Qiu, J. Zhou, Z. Hou, *Electrochim. Acta*, 174 (2015) 1096-1103.
- 11. G.R. Xu, Y. Wen, X.P. Min, W.H. Dong, A.P. Tang, H.S. Song, *Electrochim. Acta*, 186 (2015) 133-141.
- 12. Q. Yi, H. Chu, M. Tang, Y. Zhang, X. Liu, Z. Zhou, H. Nie, Fuel Cells, 14 (2014) 827-833.
- 13. C. An, W. Li, M. Wang, Q. Deng, Y. Wang, Electrochim. Acta, 283 (2018) 603-610.
- 14. X. Bai, X. Tong, Y. Gao, W. Zhu, C. Fu, J. Ma, T. Tan, C. Wang, Y. Luo, H. Sun, *Electrochim. Acta*, 281 (2018) 525-533.
- 15. X. Feng, Y. Li, G. Chen, Z. Liu, X. Ning, A. Hu, Q. Tang, X. Chen, *Mater. Lett.*, 231 (2018) 114-118.
- 16. P. Liu, Y. Zhu, X. Gao, Y. Huang, Y. Wang, S. Qin, Y. Zhang, Chem. Eng. J., 350 (2018) 79-88.
- 17. X. Zhang, J. Xu, H. Wang, J. Zhang, H. Yan, B. Pan, J. Zhou, Y. Xie, *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.*, 52 (2013) 4361-4365.
- 18. J. Liu, C. Zhang, T.W. Rees, L. Ke, L. Ji, H. Chao, Coordin. Chem. Rev., 363 (2018) 17-28.
- 19. S. Zhang, W. Shi, P. Cheng, Coordin. Chem. Rev., 352 (2017) 108-150.
- 20. J. Yin, G.C. Zhu, B.L. Deng, Desalination, 379 (2016) 93-101.
- 21. Q. Yi, H. Chu, Q. Chen, Z. Yang, X. Liu, Electroanal., 27 (2015) 388-397.
- 22. Y. Zheng, L. Zhang, P. He, D. Dang, Q. Zeng, J. Zeng, M. Liu, *Electrocatal.*, 9 (2018) 495-504.
- 23. Z.L. Deng, Q.F. Yi, G. Li, Y. Chen, X.K. Yang, H.D. Nie, Electrochim. Acta, 279 (2018) 1-9.
- 24. Y. Zou, C. Cai, C. Xiang, P. Huang, H. Chu, Z. She, F. Xu, L. Sun, H.B. Kraatz, *Electrochim. Acta*, 261 (2018) 537-547.

- 25. A. Kumar, D. Sarkar, S. Mukherjee, S. Patil, D.D. Sarma, A. Shukla, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces, 10 (2018) 42484-42493.
- 26. X.Y. Yu, L. Deng, B. Zheng, B.R. Zeng, P. Yi, X. Xu, Dalton T., 43 (2014) 1524-1533.
- 27. M. Tang, Y. Yang, S. Zhang, J. Chen, J. Zhang, Z. Zhou, Q. Liu, Inorg. Chem., 57 (2018) 277-287.
- 28. S. Zhang, H. Li, E. Duan, Z. Han, L. Li, J. Tang, W. Shi, P. Cheng, *Inorg. Chem.*, 55 (2016) 1202-1207.
- 29. B. Zheng, R. Yun, J. Bai, Z. Lu, L. Du, Y. Li, Inorg. Chem., 52 (2013) 2823-2829.
- 30. X. Xia, Y. Long, J. Wang, Anal. Chim. Acta, 772 (2013) 81-86.
- 31. Q. Yi, Q. Chen, *Electrochim. Acta*, 182 (2015) 96-103.
- 32. J. Tang, W. Gong, T. Cai, T. Xie, C. Deng, Z. Peng, Q. Deng, RSC Adv., 3 (2013) 2543-2547.
- 33. Q. Yi, Y. Zhang, X. Liu, Y. Yang, Sci. Chi. Chem., 57 (2014) 739-747.
- 34. R.B. Li, L.L. Yu, S. Li, J. Fan, R. Luo, J.T. Zhao, *Electrochim. Acta*, 284 (2018) 52-59.
- 35. H. Peng, Z. Mo, S. Liao, H. Liang, L. Yang, F. Luo, H. Song, Y. Zhong, B. Zhang, *Sci. Rep.*, 3 (2013).
- 36. Z. Wang, B. Zheng, H. Liu, X. Lin, X. Yu, P. Yi, R. Yun, Cryst. Growth Des., 13 (2013) 5001-5006.
- 37. L. Bao, B. Liu, X. Li, C. Pan, Y. Xie, X. Lu, Dalton T., 45 (2016) 11606-11610.
- 38. Z. Wang, B. Zheng, H. Liu, P. Yi, X. Li, X. Yu, R. Yun, Dalton T., 42 (2013) 11304-11311.
- 39. Q. Yi, L. Li, W. Yu, Z. Zhou, G. Xu, J. Mol. Catal. A-Chem., 295 (2008) 34-38.
- 40. Q. Yu, Z. Shi, X. Liu, S. Luo, W. Wei, J. Electroanal. Chem., 655 (2011) 92-95.
- 41. Q. Yi, W. Yu, J. Electroanal. Chem., 633 (2009) 159-164.
- 42. Q. Yi, H. Chu, M. Tang, Z. Yang, Q. Chen, X. Liu, J. Electroanal. Chem., 739 (2015) 178-186.
- 43. S. Chen, L. Zhang, Y. Long, F. Zhou, *Electroanal.*, 26 (2014) 1236-1248.
- 44. H. Song, A. Tang, G. Xu, L. Liu, M. Yin, Y. Pan, Int. J. Electrochem. Sci., 13 (2018) 4720-4730.
- 45. K. Deng, C. Li, X. Qiu, J. Zhou, Z. Hou, J. Electroanal. Chem., 755 (2015) 197-202.
- 46. J. Chen, Y. Li, K. Lv, W. Zhong, H. Wang, Z. Wu, P. Yi, J. Jiang, Sens. Actuators B Chem., 224 (2016) 298-306.
- 47. X.P. Chen, J. Wen, C.X. Zhao, Y.T. Li, N. Wang, Chemistryselect, 3 (2018) 9301-9307.
- 48. Y. Chen, J. Zhang, M. Li, C. Yang, L. Zhang, C. Wang, H. Lu, *Electrochim. Acta*, 292 (2018) 115-124.
- 49. M. Cui, S. Tang, Y. Ma, X. Shi, J.A. Syed, X. Meng, J. Power Sources, 396 (2018) 483-490.
- 50. Q. Gao, J. Wang, B. Ke, J. Wang, Y. Li, Ceram. Int., 44 (2018) 18770-18775.
- 51. S. Sun, L. Guo, X. Chang, Y. Yu, X. Zhai, Mater. Lett., 236 (2019) 558-561.
- 52. C.R. Tan, Z.H. Su, B.G. Lin, H.W. Huang, Y.L. Zeng, S. Li, H. Huang, Y.-J. Wang, C.X. Li, G.L. Shen, R.Q. Yu, *Anal. Chimica Acta*, 678 (2010) 203-207.
- 53. H. Huang, X. Liu, T. Hu, P.K. Chu, Biosens. Bioelectron., 25 (2010) 2078-2083.

© 2019 The Authors. Published by ESG (<u>www.electrochemsci.org</u>). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).