Electrochemical Performance of VO$^{2+}$/VO$^{2+}$ Redox Couple in the H$_2$SO$_4$-CH$_3$SO$_3$H Solutions

Youqun Chu, Chongzhong Liu, Haiming Ren, Yongfa Zhang, Chun'an Ma*

State Key Laboratory Breeding Base of Green Chemistry-Synthesis Technology, Chemical Engineering College, Zhejiang University of Technology, Hangzhou 310014, China
*E-mail: science@zjut.edu.cn

Received: 31 May 2015 / Accepted: 15 December 2015 / Published: 1 February 2016

The mixed acids with different ratio of H$_2$SO$_4$ to CH$_3$SO$_3$H were prepared, and their application in the vanadium redox flow battery (VRFB) as supporting electrolytes had been examined. It was found the solubility and stability of vanadium ions can be significantly enhanced by the increasing of CH$_3$SO$_3$H content in the mixed acid system. The electrochemical behaviors of VO$^{2+}$/VO$^{2+}$ couple in different mixed acids were further studied by cyclic voltammetry (CV) and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS). The results showed that the electrochemical activities, including the reversibility of electrode reaction, the reaction resistance for VO$^{2+}$/VO$^{2+}$ couple were closely related to the CH$_3$SO$_3$H content in the mixed acid system, and reached the best value in the solution using 2.75 mol/L H$_2$SO$_4$ + 0.25 mol/L CH$_3$SO$_3$H mixed acid as supporting electrolyte. The VRFB with the optimized mixed acid electrolyte exhibits higher energy efficiency and the similar current efficiency compared with those of H$_2$SO$_4$ system.

Keywords: vanadium redox flow battery; electrochemical performance; methane sulfonic acid; mixed acid solution

1. INTRODUCTION

Recently, vanadium redox flow battery (VRFB) has received remarkable attentions as a promising energy storage technology for intermittently renewable energy because of its advanced characteristics such as long cyclic life, flexible design and high reliability [1–5]. The VRFBs utilize the V$^{2+}$/V$^{3+}$ and VO$^{2+}$/VO$^{2+}$ redox couples to act as the negative and positive electrolytes, respectively. During battery discharge, VO$^{2+}$ is reduced to VO$^{2+}$ at the positive, accompanied by a concomitant oxidation of V$^{2+}$ to V$^{3+}$ at the negative; charging a VRFB reverses this process. Therefore, the energy density of VRFB is directly determined by the concentrations of vanadium ions in the electrolyte.
Sulfuric acid is a commonly used supporting electrolyte in the VRFB. Unfortunately, in sulfuric acid solution, hydrated penta co-ordinated vanadate ion $[\text{VO}_2(\text{H}_2\text{O})_3]^+$ is apt to form $\text{V}_2\text{O}_5$ precipitation [6]. The poor stability of electrolytes, especially positive electrolyte, greatly limits the concentration of vanadium ions in the electrolyte, which limits the energy density of VRFB in turn.

For the purpose of developing stable electrolytes with high concentration of vanadium ions, many tactics have been proposed to inhibit the precipitate formation in the positive electrolyte of VRFB [7–13], such as adding additives, increasing the concentration of supporting electrolyte, using the mixed acid ($\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$-$\text{HCl}$, $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$-$\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$) system, etc. Among them, Li et al. [12] reported a very attractive result that a 2.5 mol/L vanadium electrolyte in a mixture of sulfuric acid and hydrochloric acid shows excellent electrochemical performance and thermal stability. But accompanying with the introduction of $\text{Cl}^-$, the evolution of chlorine may occur at the electrode in the anode process due to the inconsistency of the cells. Peng et al. [13] evaluated the electrochemical behaviors of 2 mol/L positive electrolyte for VRFB in 1.5 mol/L $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$+$1.5$ mol/L $\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ mixed acids, which exhibited good electrochemical activity and charge-discharge performance. This preliminary exploration shows that the $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$-$\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ mixed acid is a promising supporting electrolyte for VRFB. However, only the performance of 2 mol/L VO$^{2+}$ electrolyte in 1.5 mol/L $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$+$1.5$ mol/L $\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ and in 3.0 mol/L $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$ was reported in the literature, the influences of the ratio of $\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ to $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$ on the electrochemical activity and stability of the electrolytes are worthy of further study.

To elucidate the effects of composition of $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$-$\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ mixed acid, the solubility, stability, electrochemical properties of vanadium ions in the solutions with different ratio of $\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ to $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$ were studied in the present paper. And the cyclic performance of VRFBs using $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$-$\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ mixed acid as supporting electrolytes was also studied by a galvanostatic charging/discharging method.

2. EXPERIMENTAL

2.1 Solubility of VOSO$_4$

Table 1 Composition of $\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4$-$\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H}$ mixed acids

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>$C(\text{H}_2\text{SO}_4)$/mol/L</th>
<th>$C(\text{CH}_3\text{SO}_3\text{H})$ /mol/L</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The compositions of H$_2$SO$_4$-CH$_3$SO$_3$H mixed acids studied in this work are listed in Table 1. To determine the solubility of VOSO$_4$ in the mixed acids, excess amount of VOSO$_4$-nH$_2$O (Shanghai Huating Chemical Co. Ltd., China, n=3.5) was added into 30 mL of each mixed acid, then sonicated for 30 min, after that the solutions were kept in sealed bottles at 25 °C for 30 days. Then the concentration of vanadium ions in the upper clear liquid was analyzed by an inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (ICP-MS).

2.2 Electrochemical study

An IviumStat potentiostat (Ivium Technologies, the Netherlands) was employed for cyclic voltammetry (CV) and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) measurements. Electrochemical experiments were carried out in a 3-electrode electrochemical cell with a graphite disk electrode with a surface area of 0.785 cm$^2$ as the working electrode, a large graphite plate as the counter electrode and a saturated calomel electrode (SCE) along with a salt bridge as the reference electrode. The CV curves were obtained between 0 V and 1.6 V. And the EIS tests were performed with an excitation signal of 5 mV in the frequency range of 0.01 Hz and 100 kHz. Prior to each measurement, the working electrode was manually polished with 0.3 and 0.5 μm α-Al$_2$O$_3$ powder and then washed by ultrasonic cleaning in doubly distilled water for 10 min. All electrochemical experiments were conducted at room temperature.

2.3 Stability of VO$_2^+$

To investigate the stability of VO$_2^+$, three typical solutions (No.1, 8 and 9 mixed acids listed in Table 1) containing ca. 2 mol/L VO$_2^+$ were prepared by electrooxidation of VOSO$_4$. 100 mL of tested solution was added into a sealed bottle, then placed in 40 °C water bath. The concentrations of VO$_2^+$ in these solutions were periodically measured by redox titration using an automatic potentiometric titrator (ZDJ-4A, Shanghai ray magnetic).

2.4 Charge-discharge test

A VRFB single cell was fabricated by sandwiching a piece of N115 perfluorinated ion-exchange membrane (Best Co., China) between two pieces of polyacrylonitrile (PAN)-based graphite felts with an area of 3×3 cm$^2$ and thickness of 5 mm (Shenhe Carbon Fiber Materials Co., China), two piece of graphite plates were used as the current collectors. The graphite felts were treated in air at 500 °C for 2 h to improve electrocatalytic activity and hydrophilicity. Two 40 mL vanadium solutions serving as negative and positive electrolytes were cyclically pumped into the corresponding half-cell by two peristaltic pumps (BT100-1L, Baoding Longer Precision Pump Co., China) with a flow rate of 20 mL/min. The performance of VRFBs was evaluated at room temperature by a BT2000 battery test system (Arbin, USA). The VRFBs were charged with 20 mA/cm$^2$ for 3 h (0.54 Ah), and then discharged to the cut-off voltage of 0.8 V with the same current density.
3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Solubility of mixed acids

Table 2 shows the solubility of VOSO\(_4\) in the mixed acids determined by ICP-MS. It can be seen that the saturated concentration of V\(^{4+}\) in the solutions decreases from 125 g/L to ca. 74 g/L with the decreasing of CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H concentration from 3 mol/L to 0 and the increasing of H\(_2\)SO\(_4\) concentration from 0 to 3 mol/L. This indicates that CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H can dissolve more VOSO\(_4\) than H\(_2\)SO\(_4\), and all mixed acids, besides CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H solution, have higher solubility of VOSO\(_4\) than H\(_2\)SO\(_4\) solution[14]. Due to the energy density of VRFB depends on the concentration of vanadium ions, compared with H\(_2\)SO\(_4\) solution, CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H solution and mixed acids may have higher specific energy when used as supporting electrolytes in VRFBs. However, for the application in VRFB, further research is needed to examine the electrochemical activity and stability of vanadium ions in the mixed acids.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mixed acid</th>
<th>No.1</th>
<th>No.2</th>
<th>No.3</th>
<th>No.4</th>
<th>No.5</th>
<th>No.6</th>
<th>No.7</th>
<th>No.8</th>
<th>No.9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V(^{4+}) (g/L)</td>
<td>125.005</td>
<td>106.123</td>
<td>96.037</td>
<td>92.181</td>
<td>90.168</td>
<td>89.527</td>
<td>87.095</td>
<td>81.365</td>
<td>73.817</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2 Cyclic voltammetry

The cyclic voltammograms of mixed acids containing 1.5 mol/L VOSO\(_4\) on the graphite disk electrode are shown in Fig. 1. The CV curves of these solutions are similar to each other in peak shape and exhibit evidently only one couple of redox peaks which corresponds to the redox reaction between VO\(^{2+}\) and VO\(^{2+}\). However, the oxidative and reductive peak currents increase with the increasing of H\(_2\)SO\(_4\) and decreasing of CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H in the electrolyte, and reach the biggest value in the No.8 mixed acid (2.75 mol/L H\(_2\)SO\(_4\)+0.25 mol/L CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H). This may be associated with the higher conductivity of H\(_2\)SO\(_4\) than that of CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H, whereas the addition of a certain amount of CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H in the solution is beneficial to the electrochemical reaction of VO\(^{2+}/\)VO\(^{2+}\) couple on the graphite electrode. The biggest redox peak currents and the smallest separation between the oxidation and reduction peak potentials (\(\Delta E_p\)) are obtained in the electrolyte using No.8 mixed acid as supporting electrolyte. This implies that the vanadium ions in this solution have the best electrochemical reaction kinetics, which may be ascribed to the variation of existential states of vanadium ions after the addition of CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H[15].

To further study the reversibility of VO\(^{2+}/\)VO\(^{2+}\) couple in the No.8 mixed acid, CV curves at various potential scan rate were measured, as well as those in the CH\(_3\)SO\(_3\)H (No.1 in Table 1) and H\(_2\)SO\(_4\) (No.9 in Table 1). It can be seen from Fig. 2(a-c) that the oxidation and reduction peak currents increase with the increasing of potential scan rate in all three electrolytes.
Figure 1. Cyclic voltammograms of mixed acids with different ratio of H$_2$SO$_4$ to CH$_3$SO$_3$H. Electrolytes: 1.5 mol/L VOSO$_4$ contained in the mixed acids listed in Table 1; Scan rate: 50mV/s

And the oxidation/reduction peak currents (i$_{p}$) have a good linear relationship with the square root of the scan rates ($\nu^{1/2}$) (Fig.2d), confirming that the oxidation of VO$^{2+}$ and reduction of VO$_2^+$ in all three electrolytes are controlled by mass transport process[16]. The potential differences between oxidation and reduction peaks ($\Delta$E$_p$) in the No.8 mixed acid (Fig.2a) keep around ca. 50 mV when the potential scan rate varies from 10 mV/s to 90 mV/s, while significant increasing of $\Delta$E$_p$ can be found in the other two electrolytes (CH$_3$SO$_3$H and H$_2$SO$_4$ ) (Fig.2b and c). This further proves that electrochemical reversibility of VO$^{2+}$/VO$_2^+$ couple in the No.8 mixed acid is better than those in the other two electrolytes (No.1 and No.9). According to the Randles-Sevcik equation[17], the above results may be ascribed to the higher diffusion rate of VO$^{2+}$/VO$_2^+$ couple in the No.8 mixed acid.
Figure 2. Cyclic voltammetric characteristics of mixed acid (a), CH$_3$SO$_3$H (b) and H$_2$SO$_4$ (c) at various potential scan rate. Electrolytes: 1.5 mol/L VOSO$_4$ contained in the mixed acids No.1, 8 and 9 listed in Table 1

3.3 Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy

To better understanding the influence of solution composition on electrochemical behavior of VO$^{2+}$/VO$_2^+$ couple, electrochemical impedance spectra were measured at the formal potential ($\phi_f$). The formal potential is calculated according to the following equation[18], $\phi_f = \frac{\phi_{pc} + \phi_{pa}}{2}$, in which $\phi_{pa}$ and $\phi_{pc}$ are oxidation peak potential and reduction peak potential, respectively, obtained from the CV curves shown in Fig.1.

Figure 3. Nyquist plots of electrochemical impedance spectra. Electrolytes: 1.5 mol/L VOSO$_4$ contained in the mixed acids listed in Table 1
It can be seen from Fig. 3 that each plot consists of a semicircle in the high frequency region and a sloped line in the low frequency region, indicating that the redox reaction of VO$^{2+}$/VO$^2_2$+ couple at the graphite electrode is simultaneously controlled by the charge transfer process and the diffusion process[19]. From the partial enlargement of the Nyquist plots in high frequency (the inset of Fig. 3), it can also be observed that the semicircles have different starting point and radius in different electrolytes, corresponding to different ohmic resistance (composed of solution resistance, electrode resistance and the contact resistance) and charge transfer resistance. In all nine electrolytes, the plot obtained in the solution containing 1.5 mol/L VOSO$_4$+2.75 mol/L H$_2$SO$_4$+0.25 mol/L CH$_3$SO$_3$H has the smallest ohmic resistance and charge transfer resistance, implying that the best conductivity and electrochemical activity of VO$^{2+}$/VO$^2_2$+ couple can be achieved in this solution. This may be the reason for the cyclic voltammetric behaviors shown in Fig.1 and Fig.2.

3.4 Stability of the VO$_2^+$ solution

As mentioned in the Introduction, the stability of VO$_2^+$ in the positive electrolyte of VRFB is poor at an elevated temperature. To evaluate the influence of solution composition on the stability of VO$_2^+$, three typical solutions (No.1, No.8 and No.9 mixed acids) containing ca. 2.0 mol/L VO$_2^+$ were prepared by electrooxidation of VOSO$_4$, and the initial concentrations of VO$_2^+$ determined by redox titration were 2.02, 1.99 and 1.98 mol/L, respectively. Fig. 4 shows the change of VO$_2^+$ concentration in the as-prepared three solutions as a function of time at 40 °C. In all three solutions the VO$_2^+$ concentration decreases with the prolonging of time, which may be ascribed to the formation of V$_2$O$_5$ precipitate[6]. After 120 h, the VO$_2^+$ concentration in 3 mol/L H$_2$SO$_4$ decreases to 1.12 mol/L, about 56.6% of the initial value (1.98 mol/L), while the concentration changes in the other two solutions are relatively smaller, 69.3% and 73.3% of the initial values in No.8 mixed acid and 3 mol/L CH$_3$SO$_3$H, respectively. This demonstrates the existence of CH$_3$SO$_3$H in the solution can improve the stability of VO$_2^+$, which may be ascribed to the high solubility of vanadium ions in CH$_3$SO$_3$H[14]. Therefore, better performance can be expected for the VRFB using mixed acid containing CH$_3$SO$_3$H as electrolyte.

![Figure 4. VO$_2^+$ concentration changes with time in different solutions. Electrolytes: ca. 2 mol/L VO$_2^+$ contained in the mixed acids listed in Table 1](image-url)
3.5 Charge-discharge curves

The above-mentioned experimental results show that the increasing of CH\textsubscript{3}SO\textsubscript{3}H content in the supporting solution is beneficial to enhance the solubility and stability of vanadium ions in the electrolyte, but goes against the electrolyte conductivity and electrochemical activity of vanadium ions. Taking into consideration of various factors, the No.8 mixed acid exhibits the best performance compared to the others listed in Table 1. For further evaluation, the performance of a VRFB using No.8 mixed acid as supporting electrolyte was investigated, and that in 3 mol/L H\textsubscript{2}SO\textsubscript{4} was also measured for comparison. Fig. 5a shows the typical charge-discharge curves of No.8 and No.9 mixed acids containing 1.5 mol/L vanadium ions, respectively. It can be seen that the VRFB using No.8 mixed acid as supporting electrolyte has lower charge voltage and higher discharge voltage. This may result from the higher conductivity and better electrochemical activity of vanadium ions in No.8 mixed acid\textsuperscript{[14]}. Fig. 5b and 5c show the cyclic performance of two VRFBs using No.8 and No.9 mixed acids as supporting electrolyte, respectively.
Electrochemical behavior of VRFBs with different electrolytes. Electrolyte: 1.5 mol/L vanadium ions contained in the No. 8 and No.9 mixed acids; a) Typical charge-discharge curves; b) Discharge capacities and energies; c) Performance of VRFBs

For both VRFBs in 80 cycles, almost the same discharge capacities (Fig. 5b) and current efficiencies (CE, Fig. 5c) can be achieved. This implies both VRFBs show good cyclic stability and reversibility in 80 cycles. In addition, VRFB using No.8 mixed acid as support electrolyte has higher voltage efficiency (VE, ca.81%) than that in 3 mol/L H₂SO₄ (ca.76%), which results in the higher discharge energy and energy efficiency in No.8 mixed acid compared with those in No.9 system.

4. CONCLUSIONS

The solubility and stability of vanadium ions can be significantly enhanced by the increasing of CH₃SO₃H content in the H₂SO₄-CH₃SO₂H mixed acid system. On the contrary, the negative effects are observed on solution resistance and electrochemical kinetics of VO²⁺/VO₂⁺ couple with the increasing of CH₃SO₃H. This may be related to the high viscosity of CH₃SO₂H and different complexation of CH₃SO₃ with vanadium ions compared with H₂SO₄. Within the scope of this work, the best electrochemical reversibility of VO²⁺/VO₂⁺ couple can be obtained in the solution using 2.75 mol/L H₂SO₄+0.25 mol/L CH₃SO₂H mixed acid as supporting electrolyte. At this point, the advantages and disadvantages factors resulting from the addition of CH₃SO₂H may reach a compromise. The VRFB with the optimized mixed acid electrolyte exhibits higher energy efficiency and the same high current efficiency compared with those of H₂SO₄ system. With the further evaluation and optimization, H₂SO₄-CH₃SO₂H mixed acid is of great potential for the practical application in the VRFBs with excellent properties.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
This work is financially supported by Innovation Team Project of Science Technology Department of Zhejiang Province (2011R09002-05) and Natural Science Foundation of Zhejiang Province (LY12B03004).
References


© 2016 The Authors. Published by ESG (www.electrochemsci.org). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).