Novel Synthesis of High Pure Titanium Trichloride in Molten CaCl₂

Jianxun Song¹, Qiuyu Wang¹, Minho Kang^{1,2}, Shuqiang Jiao^{1,*}

¹ State Key Lab of Advanced Metallurgy, University of Science and Technology Beijing, No.30 Xueyuan Road, Beijing, 100083, P.R China

² School of Metallurgical Engineering, Kim Chaek University of Technology, Pyongyang, DPR Korea *E-mail: <u>sjiao@ustb.edu.cn</u>

Received: 5 October 2014 / Accepted: 24 November 2014 / Published: 2 December 2014

A novel synthesis and enrichment processes for high pure $TiCl_3$ in molten $CaCl_2$ were experimentally investigated in this study. Two steps were carried out: the first is the preparation of titanium subchloride, and the second is the enrichment process of $TiCl_3$ with HCl gas. The titanium subchloride was prepared by the reaction of titanium tetrachloride with metallic titanium in molten $CaCl_2$. The HCl gas was used to purify the melt before a series of experiments were done. Also, it was introduced into the melt when $TiCl_2$ reached to the saturated solubility (7.89 wt.%) at 1123 K. The power of high pure $TiCl_3$ was collected on the top container of special designed equipment. The collection efficiency of $TiCl_3$ keeps above on 95%, and the utilized efficiency of HCl decreased with the intruding rate increasing. X-ray diffraction and EDS results demonstrated that the products were pure $TiCl_3$. SEM result disclosed that the pure $TiCl_3$ was dense and homogeneous with an agglomerative structure.

Keywords: Yttria-stabilized zirconia electrode; Subchloride titanium; Pure TiCl₃; HCl gas; CaCl₂ melt;

1. INTRODUCTION

The electrochemistry and thermodynamic properties of titanium subchlorides in molten salts has been the subject of many investigations [1-5]. It was disclosed that titanium ions are present in the electrolyte in different valences may favor reoxidation and disproportionation reactions [6-9]. They will result in a very low current density and complication for the electrodeposition process [10-11]. Therefore, it is meaningful for the foundation studies of the titanium subchloride (TiCl_x, x=2, 3) which have been used as a titanium ions source material in molten salt for the recovery of metallic titanium by chloride metallurgy [12-16], electrolysis [17-18] and disproportionation [6, 7, 16].

The synthetic process for obtaining titanium subchlorides mixture by the reaction of titanium tetrachloride with metallic titanium at 1273 K was investigated [16]. However, a very small number of studies were conducted on high pure titanium trichloride (TiCl₃) synthesis that was employed in molten salt media directly. Thus far, TiCl₃ has been prepared by reducing TiCl₄ with hydrogen gas (H₂) in Re. (1) at high temperatures [19-20], or by the aluminothermic reduction of TiCl₄ or distillation [21].

$$2\text{TiCl}_4 + \text{H}_2 = 2\text{HCl} + 2\text{TiCl}_3 \tag{1}$$

However, the approximate volatility and tendency to disproportionation of $TiCl_3$ make the clean separation of $TiCl_3$ from other metal chlorides difficult. Furthermore, it is hard to occur for the Re. (1) by calculated the Gibbs free energy (83.73 kJ/mol) at 1123K.

A new synthetic and enrichment processes for high pure $TiCl_3$ in the molten salt were experimentally investigated in this study. A simple and compact reaction apparatus was used which is suitable for the reaction of $TiCl_4$ with metallic titanium producing titanium subchloride. Based on this background, experiments for the enrichment process of $TiCl_3$ in molten salt were carried out.

2. EXPERIMENT

2.1 TiCl_x synthesis in molten salt

The calcium chloride is expected to work as a medium for its low vapour pressures. The vapour pressures of the different molten salts at the respective likely minimum operating temperatures are given in Table 1 [22].

Salt [22]	M.P. <i>T</i> / K	P _{Vap} / Pa
LiCl	903	4.2
NaCl	1094	60
MgCl ₂	1007	61
$CaCl_2$	1135	0.2

Table 1. Salt vapor pressures of chloride in molten at different temperatures.

As can be seen, $CaCl_2$ has by far the lowest vapour pressure. Anhydrous $CaCl_2$ (Sinopharm Chemical Reagent Co., Ltd. analytical grade \geq 99.99%, 100 g) was dried under vacuum for more than 24 hours in a alumina crucible (95 mm outer diameter, 120 mm height, 5 mm thickness) and heated to 1123 K in an electric furnace with high pure argon gas (Sinopharm Chemical Reagent Co., Ltd. analytical grade \geq 99.99%) atmosphere. Hydrogen chloride gas (HCl, Sinopharm Chemical Reagent Co., Ltd. analytical grade \geq 99.99%) was bubbled through the melts to remove O²⁻ dissolved in the molten salt. Then, high pure argon gas was introduced into the fused salt to remove excess HCl gas.

The concentration of O^{2-} in the molten salt was determined by *emf* method with the yttriastabilized zirconia electrode (YSZE). The oxide concentration indicator electrode consisted of a tube of YSZE (3 mm diameter). The reference electrode was an Ag/AgCl electrode, which consisting of a silver wire (0.5 mm diameter) contained in a mulite tube, and dipped into a silver chloride solution (4 *wt*.%) in the CaCl₂. The auxiliary electrode was a graphite rod (6 mm diameter). The electrodes active

surface area were determined by the depth of immersion and corrected for the height of the meniscus. The variation of the YSZE potential was performed with *emf* method using a PARSTAT 4000 potentiostat (Princeton Applied Research, USA) controlled by a personal computer and specific software (VersaStudio, PAR, USA). The Nernstian behaviour of the system was demonstrated by measuring the change in electrode potential as purification with HCl gas [23-24]. The relationship between concentration of oxide and potential can be expressed as Eq. (2):

$$E_{O_2/O^{2-}} = E_{O_2/O^{2-}}^* - \frac{RT}{2F} P_{O^{2-}}$$
(2)

where $E_{O_2/O^{2-}}$ is the equilibrium potential of O_2/O^{2-} system (in V); $E_{O_2/O^{2-}}^*$ is an apparent standard potential of the system (in V) and P_O^{2-} is $\ln x_{O^{2-}}$.

After purification, titanium powders (Sinopharm Chemical Reagent Co., Ltd. analytical grade 99.99%) that used as the feed materials in the synthesis experiments were placed in a molybdenum basket [25] (Mo, 99%, octagonal pillar shape, 45 mm outer diameter, 100 mm height, 5 mm thickness) immersing in molten CaCl₂. Titanium tetrachloride is readily available commercially at pure of 99.9%, and it was purified by fractional distillation in this experiment. The schematic illustration of the experimental apparatus for the TiCl_x (x=1, 2) synthesis by the reaction of TiCl₄ with metallic titanium is shown in Fig. 1(a). Liquid TiCl₄ was fed into this reaction container at the rate of 0.13~0.72 g/min by dropping it from the top of the chamber through quartz feed tube. It was expected that the TiCl₄ was supplied in the form of gas bubble at elevated temperatures reacted with titanium power in the molten CaCl₂. After experiment, the molybdenum basket with titanium in the basket were gradually cooled in the furnace and recovered in the argon atmosphere at room temperature.







Figure 1. (a) Schematic illustration of an experimental apparatus for $TiCl_x$ synthesis by the reaction of $TiCl_4$ with metallic titanium; (b) Schematic illustration of an experimental apparatus for enrichment of $TiCl_3$.

2.2 Enrichment of TiCl₃

A schematic illustration of the experimental apparatus for $TiCl_3$ enrichment in molten $CaCl_2$ is shown in Fig. 1(b). The $CaCl_2$ -TiCl_x salt (TiCl₂ concentration of 7.89 mass%, 100g) that was obtained from the $TiCl_x$ synthesis process was filled into an alumina crucible, and it was heated to 1123 K. Then, the HCl gas was introduced into molten $CaCl_2$ with different rates afterwards. It was confirmed by Sekimoto [21] that the vapor pressure of $TiCl_3$ is so different from other chlorides that pure $TiCl_3$ can be obtained by evaporation.

After reactions, the samples obtained from quartz container were cooled to room temperature under argon gas atmosphere then covered with a polyimide film to prevent the samples from reacting with the moisture. The samples were transferred to the glove box where the content of water and oxygen was maintained under 0.2 ppm.

2.3 Analysis

The quantitative analysis of different oxidation sates of titanium ions consists of three main steps [26-28]. First, the concentration of Ti^{2+} was measured by H_2 volumetric analysis. The method is based on the fact that $TiCl_2$ can react with hydrochloric acid and generates H_2 gas in hydrochloric acid solution which is expressed by Re. (3):

$$2\mathrm{Ti}^{2+} + 2\mathrm{H}^{+} = 2\mathrm{Ti}^{3+} + \mathrm{H}_{2} \tag{3}$$

The oxygen dissolved in diluted hydrochloric acid can oxidize Ti^{2+} in the process of determination of Ti^{2+} , which can cause the underestimation of Ti^{2+} concentration in the sample. Vacuum-deaeration was used to remove the O²⁻ dissolved in deionized water then the deoxygenized water. The deoxygenized hydrochloric acid solution was saturated by bubbling of high pure H₂ to prevent the H₂ generated by Re. (3) dissolving in the hydrochloric acid solution before the reaction. After the reaction, all of the Ti³⁺ in the solution consists of Ti³⁺ which is original in the sample and the Ti³⁺ generated by Re. (3). The concentration of Ti³⁺ in the solution was determined by the titrimetric analysis using NH₄Fe(SO₄)₂ aqueous solution which was acidified with sulfuric acid. The Ti³⁺ in the solution reacts with Fe³⁺ as Re. (4):

$$Ti^{3+} + Fe^{3+} = Ti^{4+} + Fe^{2+}$$
(4)

The titration process was conducted in high pure argon atmosphere. Finally, the total titanium ions $(Ti^{2+}, Ti^{3+} \text{ and } Ti^{4+})$ amount in the other solution was determined by diantipyrylmethane spectrophotometry.

The crystal phases and morphology of products were characterized by X-ray diffraction (XRD, Rigaku, D/max-RB) and field emission scanning electron microscopy (FESEM, JEOL, JEM-6701F) operated at an accelerating voltage of 30 kV, together with EDS was used to study the surface morphology and elements content of the samples, respectively.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The variation of P_0^{2-} during the purification of the melt with HCl is disclosed by YSZE shown in Fig. 2.



Figure 2. Variation of the P_0^{2-} during the purification of the melt by HCl gas which measured with an oxide specific electrode based on YSZE.

One can see from Fig. 2 that the residual concentration of O^{2-} ions in the melt after fusion under vacuum is about $1.0 \times 10^{-1.78}$ mol/kg (265 ppm). When the HCl gas was passed through the salt, there

was a rapid decrease in the oxide-ion concentration which maintained a near constant value of $1.0 \times 10^{-5.41}$ (0.06 ppm). However, there was a rapid increase in oxide concentration as soon as argon was bubbled through the melt, which nearly reached to $1.0 \times 10^{-4.13}$ mol/kg⁻¹ (1.18 ppm) in the melt. It was owned to the traces of water contained in the argon gas, and reacting with the salt according to [23]:

$$H_2O(g) + 2Cl^- = O^{2-} + 2HCl(g)$$
 (5)

So the residual oxide concentration is conditioned by the quality of the argon employed, a similar behavior observed in other molten chlorides.



Figure 3. Various concentration of Ti²⁺ with the relationship of (a) The feeding volume of TiCl₄; (b) mass consumption of metallic titanium.

Fig. 3(a) shows the analytical concentrations of Ti^{2+} various in molten CaCl₂ while feeding of TiCl₄. It increases sharply and the consumption of titanium has the same tendency while introducing TiCl₄ in Fig. 3(b). The mainly reactions accord to Re. (6) and Re. (7):

$$1/2Ti + 1/2TiCl_4(g) = TiCl_2$$
 (6)

$$1/4\mathrm{Ti} + 3/4\mathrm{Ti}\mathrm{Cl}_4(g) = \mathrm{Ti}\mathrm{Cl}_3 \tag{7}$$

The Gibbs free energies of formation (ΔG_f^0) of TiCl₂ and TiCl₃ are -5.362 kJ/mol and -2.035 kJ/mol, respectively. Therefore, besides the TiCl₂, the TiCl₃ will be obtained at the same time.

Table 2. The total yield mass of TiCl₃, the mass in the melt and the collected from the top of container.

Exp. No.	Total Ti content, wt.%	Concentration of Ti ²⁺ ion, $x_{Ti^{2+}}/$ mol%	Concentration of Ti ³⁺ ion, $x_{Ti^{3+}}/$ mol%	Equilibrium Constant, <i>K</i> c	Std.
А	6.01	0.0772	0.0064	0.089	
В	5.20	0.0670	0.0054	0.097	
С	4.54	0.0588	0.0043	0.092	0.0059
D	4.34	0.0561	0.0043	0.104	
Е	4.20	0.0544	0.0040	0.099	

Where $x_{T_1^{2+}}$, $x_{T_1^{3+}}$ is the molar fraction of Ti²⁺ and Ti³⁺, and K_c is expressed as $K_c = x_{T_1^{3+}}^2 x_{T_1} / x_{T_1^{2+}}^3$.

Actually, the titanium trichloride that was detected comes from two sources: one is the products from Re.(7), and the other yields from the disproportionation among metallic titanium, TiCl₂ and TiCl₃ ($3\text{TiCl}_2=\text{Ti}+2\text{TiCl}_3$). Table 2 shows the equilibrium constant ($K_c = x_{Ti^{3+}}^2 \cdot x_{Ti} / x_{Ti}^3 / x_{Ti}^3$) for the disproportionation. The average value of K_c is 0.096 (with Std. of 0.059) at 1123K in molten CaCl₂.

Table 3. Chemical analysis results of $x_{r_{1}^{2+}}$, $x_{r_{1}^{3+}}$, and K_c with filtering.

Time.	TiCl ₃ in the melt,	Collection of TiCl ₃ ,	Yield of TiCl ₃ ,
<i>t</i> / s	m _{liquid} / g	$m_{ m solid}$ / g	$m_{ m yield}$ / g
30	0.548	0.157	0.705
50	1.367	0.632	1.999
70	2.322	0.973	3.295
90	2.757	1.201	3.958

The yield of $TiCl_3$ can be expressed by Eq. (8) and results list in Table 3.

$$m_{\rm yield} = m_{\rm liquid} + m_{\rm solid}$$

Where m_{yield} is the total mass of TiCl₃, m_{liquid} is the mass of TiCl₃ in molten CaCl₂, m_{solid} is the collection mass of TiCl₃ on the top of container show in Fig 1(b).

The results of first column in Table 3 show analytical concentration of $TiCl_3$, and they are corresponding with the analytical concentration of $TiCl_2$ according to above disproportionation when containing metallic in the melt. The solid state $TiCl_3$ was observed on the top container. It was indicated that one part of $TiCl_3$ can be volatilized from the melt for its vapor pressure is different from other chlorides. Results show in the second column of Table 3.

Moreover, Fig. 3(a) and Fig. 3(b) show the concentration of Ti^{2+} keeps to a constant as 7.89 wt.% while $TiCl_4$ and metallic titanium were consumed in molten $CaCl_2$. The conclusion can be made that the saturated solubility of $TiCl_2$ in $CaCl_2$ at 1123K is 7.89 wt.%. Therefore, the reactions occurring at this time are Re. (6), (7) and (9). The production of $TiCl_2$ and its consumption reach to an equilibrium status.

$$TiCl_2 + TiCl_4(g) = 2TiCl_3$$
(9)

The HCl gas was introduced into $CaCl_2$ melt that contained $TiCl_2$ with the concentration of 7.89 wt.%. The predominant reactions happened are expressed as Re. (10) and Re. (11):

$$TiCl_{2} + HCl(g) = TiCl_{3}(g) + 1/2H_{2}(g)$$
 (10)

$$Ti + 3HCl(g) = TiCl_3(g) + 3/2H_2(g)$$
 (11)

The Gibbs free energies of formation of $TiCl_3$ are -11.10 kJ/mol and -42.93 kJ/mol, respectively.



Figure 4. The relationship between concentration of TiCl₂ and yield of TiCl₃ at different introducing rate of HCl gas.

Fig. 4 shows the relationship between concentration of $TiCl_2$ and yield of $TiCl_3$ at different introduction rate of HCl gas. The concentration of $TiCl_2$ decreased while introducing of HCl gas. The

collection efficiency of $TiCl_3$ is calculated as Eq.(12). Also, the utilized efficiency of HCl is calculated as Eq.(13).

$$\eta = m_{\rm vield} / m_{\rm theory} \times 100\% \tag{12}$$

$$\eta' = m_{\rm yield} / m_{\rm theory} \times 100\% \tag{13}$$

Where m_{theory} is the mass of TiCl₃ calculated with consumed TiCl₂ in theory, and m'_{theory} is the mass of TiCl₃ for consumed HCl gas in theory.

Table 4. Collection efficiency of TiCl₃, utilized efficiency of HCl under different introducing rate of HCl gas.

Rate of HCl, $R / \text{ml min}^{-1}$	Yield of TiCl ₃ , $m_{\rm yield} \ / \ { m g}$	Theory yield of TiCl ₃ , $m_{\text{theory}} / \text{g}$	Collection efficiency of TiCl ₃ , $\eta / \%$	Efficiency of HCl, $\eta' / \%$
5	7.69	8.09	95.10	78.30
10	7.99	8.22	97.20	50.10
15	7.76	7.93	97.80	38.50
20	7.69	8.03	95.70	31.20



Figure 5. (a) X-ray diffraction pattern, (b) photo and (c) SEM micrograph of TiCl₃.

The results show in Table 4. With the increasing of the introducing rate of HCl gas, the collection efficiency of TiCl₃ keeps above on 95%, and the yield of TiCl₃ is in accordance with the decreasing of TiCl₂. However, the utilized efficiency of HCl gas decreased when increases the introducing rate. Therefore, the rate controlling step for the reaction of TiCl₂ with HCl gas is not the introducing rate of the HCl gas. The HCl will effuse as tail gas if the introducing volume higher than 20 ml/min in the experiments.

The sample and the X-ray diffraction analysis results show in Fig. 5. Fig. 5(b) shows that the fine power products with color of purple. The composition was identified by X-ray diffraction analysis which is TiCl₃ and γ -TiCl₃ (gamma structures). The micrograph of the product was confirmed by the SEM characterization show in Fig. 5 (c). It can be seen that the phase is dense and homogeneous with an agglomerative structure.



Figure 6. (a) EDS survey spectra at the surface, (b) EDS characteristic spectra, (c) EDS of elements mapping for Ti, (d) EDS of elements mapping for Cl.

Fig. 6 shows the EDS survey spectra result at the surface. The characteristic spectra show that there are two elements (Ti and Cl) for the selected surface in Fig. (b). The EDS of elements mapping for Ti and Cl show in Fig. 6(c) and (d) after surface scanned. The EDS results show that the distributions are uniform for the two elements which are consistent with the results shown in SEM. The elements content can be read in Fig. 6(b). The atom ratio of chloride and titanium, n_{Cl}/n_{Ti} , is 2.998 which mean the sample is TiCl₃. It is very close to the results discussed by Sekimoto [21]. In their work, the TiCl₃ was prepared by distillation. The cationic concentration of aluminum was low and the molar ratio of Cl and Ti was calculated to be 3.01. However, the elements of Fe, Cr and Ni other than

Ti and Al were detected in the samples. The impurity elements in the detective scope were not found in the samples for the quartz container was used in our experiments.

In summary, the synthesis process of high pure $TiCl_3$ in molten $CaCl_2$ can be concluded in two steps. The first step is that synthesis of titanium subchloride mixtures by the reaction $TiCl_4$ with Ti. The $TiCl_3$ will be collected when $TiCl_4$ was enough. The products are mainly $TiCl_2$ when titanium is excessed yet. The $TiCl_2$ was oxidized by HCl gas when it reaches to the saturated solubility in the second step, and $TiCl_3$ will volatilize on the top collector. The schematic illustration of an expected reaction system for $TiCl_3$ synthesis is show in Fig. 7. The reaction interface means the physical contact between reagents in molten $CaCl_2$.

The novel synthesis of high pure $TiCl_3$ in molten $CaCl_2$ is easy to control and operate. Moreover, it is available in mass production and can be used in titanium production in novel process.



Figure 7. Schematic illustration of an expected reaction system for TiCl₃ synthesis by the reaction of TiCl₄ with metallic titanium in molten CaCl₂.

4. CONCLUSION

In order to carry out studies on the electrolysis and equilibrium among titanium ions, a novel synthesis and enrichment processes for high pure titanium trichloride (TiCl₃) in molten CaCl₂ were experimentally investigated in this study. The molten salt was purified with HCl gas before experiments were carried out, and then the oxygen content will reduce to 1.18 ppm. There are two steps for synthesis of TiCl₃: the first is the preparation of titanium subchloride, and the second is the enrichment process of TiCl₃ with HCl gas. The titanium subchloride was prepared by the reaction of titanium tetrachloride with metallic titanium in molten CaCl₂. The equilibrium constant for the reaction $3TiCl_2=Ti+2TiCl_3$ in molten CaCl₂ at 1123K was measured by chemical analysis method in the first step, and the saturated solubility of TiCl₂ in molten CaCl₂ was determined as 7.89 wt.%. The results in the second step disclosed that the collection efficiency of TiCl₃ keeps above on 95%, and the utilized efficiency of HCl gas decreased with the rate increasing in the enrichment step. X-ray diffraction and EDS results demonstrated that the products were pure TiCl₃. SEM result disclosed that the pure TiCl₃ is dense and homogeneous with an agglomerative structure.

Int. J. Electrochem. Sci., Vol. 10, 2015 ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by the National Science Foundation of China (No. 51322402), the Program for New Century Excellent Talents in University (NCET 2011 0577), Ministry of Education of China, the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (FRF TP 12 002B, FRF AS 11 003A), and the National Basic Research Program of China (No. 2013CB632404).

Reference

- 1. H. Takamura, I. Ohno, H. Numata, J. Jpn. Inst. Metals, 60 (1996) 388.
- 2. O. Takeda, T. H. Okabe, Metall. Mater. Trans. B, 37B (2006) 823.
- 3. O. Takeda, T. H. Okabe, Mater. Trans. 47 (2006) 1145.
- 4. T. Uda, T. H. Okabe, Y. Waseda, K.T. Jacob, Metall. Mater. Trans. B, 31B (2000) 713.
- 5. A. Fuwa, S. Takaya, *JOM*, 57 (2005) 56.
- 6. O. Takeda, T. H. Okabe, Light Met. 2005(TMS), (2005) 1139.
- 7. O. Takeda, T. H. Okabe, $4^{th} UT^2$ Workshop, (2005).
- 8. H. Takamura, I. Ohno and H. Numata, J. Jpn. Inst. Metal., 60 (1996) 382.
- 9. G. Crowley, Adv. Mater. Processes, 161 (2003) 25.
- 10. D. M. Ferry, G. S. Picard, B. L. Tremillon, J. Electrochem. Soc. 135 (1988) 1443.
- 11. B. N. Popov, M. C. Kimble, R. E. White, J. Appl. Electrochem., 21 (1991) 351.
- 12. T. Oi, Toru H. Okabe, The 3rd Workshop on Reactive Metal Processing, (2007).
- 13. T. Ogasawara, Jpn. Titanium Soc., 53 (2005) 103.
- 14. A. Moriya, A. Kanai, J. Min. Mater. Process. Inst. Jpn., 109 (1993) 1164.
- 15. T. Fukuyama, M. Koizumi, M. Hanaki, S. Kosemura, J. Min. Mater. Process. Inst. Jpn., 109 (1993) 1157.
- 16. O. Takeda, T. H. Okabe, J. Alloys Compd. 457 (2008) 376.
- 17. G. M. Haarberg, W. Rolland, Â. Sterten, J. Thonstad, J. Appl. Electrochem., 23 (1993) 217.
- 18. F. Lantelme, Y. Berghoute, A. Salmi, J. Appl. Electrochem., 24 (1994) 361.
- 19. T. R. Ingraham, K. W. Downes, P. Marier, Inorganic Syntheses, 6 (1960) 52.
- 20. T. R. Ingeraham, K. W. Downes, P. Marier, Can. J. Chem., 35 (1957), 850.
- 21. H. Sekimoto, Y. Nose, T. Uda, H. Sugimura, High Temp. Mater. Proc., 30 (2011) 435.
- 22. D. S. van Vuuren, Key Eng. Mater., 520 (2012) 101.
- 23. R. F. Watson, G. S. Perry, J. Chem. Soc., Faraday Trans., 87 (1991) 2955.
- 24. Y. Castrillejo, S. Palmero, R. Pardo and P. Sbnchez Batanero, Electrochim. Acta, 38 (1993) 1743.
- 25. X. H. Ning, H. Asheim, H. Ren, S. Q. Jiao, Mater. Trans. B, 42(2011) 1181.
- 26. H. Sekimoto, Y. Nose, T. Uda, A. Uehara, Hajimu. Yamana, H. Sugimura, *Mater. Trans.*, 51 (2010) 2120.
- 27. H. Sekimoto, Y. Nose, T. Uda, A. Uehara, Hajimu. Yamana, H. Sugimura, J. Alloys Compd., 509 (2011) 5477.
- 28. Q. Y. Wang, J. X. Song, G. J. Hu, X. B. Zhu, J. G. Hou, S. Q. Jiao, H. M. Zhu, *Metall. Mater. Trans.* B, 44B (2013) 906.

© 2015 The Authors. Published by ESG (<u>www.electrochemsci.org</u>). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).